

Welthungerhilfe

Sri Lanka

Mid Term Evaluation

Country: **Sri Lanka**

Project title: **Tsunami Reconstruction Programme in the Districts of Jaffna, Mullaitivu und Kilinochchi**

Project number: AS 1273 / LKA 1051, 1052, 1055, 1062, 1064

Allocation amount:	Total	6,490,519 €
	LKA 1051	1,967,338 €
	LKA 1052	620,000 €
	LKA 1055	1,300,000 €
	LKA 1062	2,038,181 €
	LKA 1064	65,000 €

Project holder: Sewa Lanka Foundation (SLF)

Project duration:	Total	11/05 – 04/09
	LKA 1051	11/05 – 06/08
	LKA 1052	10/05 – 04/06
	LKA 1055	04/06 – 08/07
	LKA 1062	03/07 – 04/09
	LKA 1064	09/07 – 08/08

Co-financing: LKA 1051 BMZ, Stadt Bielefeld
LKA 1052 / 1055 Tagesspiegel, Radio Lippe, Stadt Bielefeld, Stadt Hamm, Bayern München Stiftung, Stadt Lohr, Stadt Hamburg/Kiel, Antenne Bayern Stiftung, Schule Saarland
LKA 1062 BMZ
LKA 1064 Antenne Bayern Stiftung

Drawn up by:

Dorothee B. Schmitt
Dipl. Ing. Civil Engineer

1 Summary

1.1 Short Project description

In March 2005, Welthungerhilfe / Sewalanka Foundation (SLF) came to an agreement with the Government Agent (GA) of Jaffna, the Tamil Eelam Administrative Services (TEAS) and the Planning and Development Secretariat (PDS) of Liberation Tigers of Tamil Eelam (LTTE) to take over the responsibility for the infrastructure rehabilitation of 5 villages in the Districts of Jaffna, Kilinochi and Mullativu.

The organisations, SLF / Welthungerhilfe were confronted with a huge reconstruction programme to be realized in a political instable and difficult situation.

All construction measures are completed (LKA 1051, LKA 1052, LKA 1055, LKA 1062, LKA 1064), except for the phase II of LKA 1062.

The following offers a short description for each project:

LKA 1051

The project's goal is the rebuilding of community-based livelihoods in nine villages in Jaffna, Kilinochi and Mullativu districts. The aim is to improve the economic status of Tsunami-affected families in the communities through strengthening of cooperatives and Community Based Organisations (CBO), including the construction of public infrastructure.

Given the limited time for the evaluation of the project, the author was not able to provide a deeper analysis of the LKA 1051 project. To follow up the huge component of livelihood programme needs more reflection based on discussions with the target group.

LKA 1052

The project duration of the project implementation of LKA 1052 was 6 months, from 15.10.2005 until 10.04.2006. The project consists of the reconstruction of 160 houses and 160 latrines.

The construction component of building 100 houses in Kallaru / Mullativu was handled by the local Government Agent (GA). The Government of Sri Lanka (GoSL) financed 75% of the total cost of the Kallaru house construction and was responsible for the logistic organisation and supervision of the construction work.

SLF / Welthungerhilfe supplied the 100 houses with roofing materials. As a matter of fact, for Kallaru the construction of 100 toilets was planned, where as only 50 were realized by the GA, leaving SLF / Welthungerhilfe with 50 toilets to build. The actual number of 20 houses in Suppermadam / Jaffna was reduced to 10 houses, and in Maruthankery /Jaffna the planned number of 20 houses was changed to 30 houses.

LKA 1055

The time frame of the project implementation of LKA 1055 was 16,5 months, from 15.04.2006 until 31.08.2007. The project consists of the reconstruction of 140 houses, 170 latrines and 150 wells in different areas.

Due to the escalation of the conflict in mid August 2006 all planned construction activities were stopped. Transportation of people and material between Wannai and Southern Sri Lanka became very difficult. Following a decision-making process among the organisations it was finally agreed at the end of 2006 to shift the housing construction from Marathankerni to Thitakkarai. As a result, there are now 90 houses in Thitakkarai as opposed to the previously planned number of 60 houses.

LKA 1062

The project LKA 1062 came at the final stage of the Tsunami Reconstruction Programme.

The original planning comprised the construction of a total of 197 houses

- Mullativu 71 houses
- Maruthankerni 89 houses
- Jaffna 37 houses

The situation in Wannu changed dramatically and the price increase of building material was immense, e.g., the price of a bag of cement fluctuated between 7.000 LKR – and 10.000 LKR.

The organisations involved began to reconsider the continuation of the construction work in Wannu and finally decided to divide the project LKA 1062 into two phases.

As a result, in phase II of the LKA 1062 project, 87 houses will now be constructed in Point Pedro in Jaffna. On short-notice, an Agreement of Allocation (AoA) was signed and will start construction work soon.

Phase I of project LKA 1062, i.e., the realization of 37 houses in Kothadi and Supparamadam, is already completed.

LKA 1064

Project LKA 1064, i.e., the rebuilding of schools in the North, was altered as the originally planned projects located within the LTTE-controlled Wannu region were no longer feasible due to the fact that the conflict was getting worse and that prices for construction materials increased dramatically.

In January 2008 a decision was reached to construct a school in Alvai / Jaffna, including a fence, a well, latrines and play-/sport materials for a school in Kallady / Jaffna, instead of the construction of a pre-school in Thithakkarai. The chance of location did not affect the objectives. The Kallady Roman Catholic School in Point Pedro is located within the project area of SLF / Welthungerhilfe, as well as the main secondary school in the division. The school was affected by the Tsunami, and only two buildings remained as usable. The available space was not sufficient to accommodate all students, leading to the decision of constructing an additional unit.

Both measures are completed and have been handed over.

Basic information regarding all construction measures:

LKA 1052 / LKA 1055 / LKA 1062

House Type

The house type was developed based on the following criteria: .

The houses were to:

- match the standard simple house type common to the area
- fulfill the minimum national standards as defined by the Planning and Development Secretariat (PDS) of the Liberation Tigers of Tamil Eelam (LTTE) and Urban Development Authority (UDA) of the Government of Sri Lanka (GoSL)
- withstand flooding
- to a large extent match the standards for reconstruction of houses for internally displaced people

The minimum living space, stipulated by the government, is 550 sq.ft (46.5 m²) with two bedrooms, 1 living room and 1 kitchen.

One of the main issues of the SLF / Welthungerhilfe reconstruction programme is the involvement and participation of the target group.

During the construction phase the beneficiaries were carrying out support work, covering the following tasks and responsibilities:

- Excavation of foundations
- Filling of the space between foundation walls

- Applying of wood preservatives to doors and windows
- White washing
- Unloading of building materials
- Supervision of the building materials stored on their plots
- Maintaining and clearing of the site
- Support during procurement of materials

The housing and school projects, as well the livelihood programme covers the same target group. All benefit from

- house construction,
- building of basic infrastructure,
- vocational training,
- support of Community Based Organistaion (CBO) development,
- and income-generating activities.

The original time frame could not be met, and a number of reasons lead to delays, especially in the area of the Wanni-region controlled by LTTE:

- The year 2005 saw an ongoing discussion between GoSL and other political and social groups about the width of the buffer zone.
- Before construction work started, mines were located on the building grounds and had to be removed. The international De-Mining Unit needed months to carry out their work.
- Following the disaster, many construction activities were started, causing a need of skilled labour country-wide. Thus, for SLF / Welthungerhilfe it was difficult to find adequate staff. (relevant for LKA 1052)
- In the Wanni region, there are two parallel administrative structures working side-by-side, i.e., administrative structures of the LTTE (TEAS and PDS) and of the GoSL (GA). , Administrative issues, such as land titles, construction permits, land surveys etc. were also put constraints on establishing reliable time schedules.
- Following a decision by the authorities, construction material needed in the Wanni region was to come from outside Wanni. This lead to additional time delays and price increases due to longer distances of transportation and time-consuming security checks at the border
- The price increases for building materials required budget revisions, including approvals, from time to time.
- Unusually heavy non-seasonal rains in October/November 2005 interrupted construction work. (Relevant for LKA 1052)

Nevertheless, the allocated budgets were not affected by the time delays, and the measures were realized within budget.

The main project activities continued successfully in spite of difficulties caused by the conflict, time delays and initial staff shortages.

Considering the evaluation criteria and the objectives, and notwithstanding the tense political situation, the implementation has been successful.

Unfortunately, the evaluator was not able to visit buildings under construction. The evaluator was shown some photo documentation of the houses at different stages of construction. These pictures made a satisfying impression.

1.2 Project holder analysis

Sewalanka Foundation (SLF) was founded as a development Non Governmental Organisation (NGO) in the year 1993 with the mandate to address the needs of the most vulnerable communities in the country.

The mission of Sewalanka Foundation is to:

Enhance the capacity of rural communities to democratically identify and address their own development needs and to provide services that contribute to the economically viable, socially just, and ecologically sustainable development of Sri Lanka.

When the conditions of the Northeast changed over the years, especially since the Cease Fire Agreement between the Tamil rebels and the Sri Lankan Government, Sewalanka shifted to strategies that will address the long-term needs of these communities. The main focus is on the strengthening of the Civil Society Organisations. Sewalanka operates through 20 District Offices spread over the country, with the Head Office in Colombo. Projects are supported from several units of the organisation.

Sewalanka Foundation is incorporated under the companies of the Legislative Enactment of the Democratic Socialist Republic of Sri Lanka and registered as a National non-profitable NGO.

Welthungerhilfe is presently registered with the Ministry of Social Services as an International Non Governmental Organisation (INGO) in Sri Lanka and also with the national secretariat of NGOs. No Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) is signed with a particular ministry regulating rights and obligations of both parties. Consequently, Welthungerhilfe may only work in Sri Lanka through a local NGO. The Welthungerhilfe staff members are advisors and monitor the implementation process.

SLF and Welthungerhilfe have been in close partnership since 1994. The programmes are focused on strengthening community-based organizations in order to contribute to stability, democracy and the future development in the North of Sri Lanka (Wanni).

Sewalanka Foundation (SLF) and Welthungerhilfe are following an exemplary approach to linking relief work with rehabilitation and development.

Sewalanka has established an account with a bank in Colombo / Vavuniya / Jaffna for the implementation of the programme. Bank transfers are released by the Head Office in Bonn following funding requests by Sewalanka and confirmed by the administrator of Welthungerhilfe.

The first cash outflow occurs after signing of the Agreement of Allocation (AoA). A cash flow plan is part of the Project Proposal (PP). Normally the payments are based on invoices, and payments are regularly checked and approved by the Welthungerhilfe administrator.

Complex building measures, with several construction units, the distribution of materials and the implementation of livelihood components, requires a large work-force. The human resources allocation is adequate regarding the evaluated projects.

The procurement of material and labour for the reconstruction activities is carried out by SLF. The process is managed by SLF and monitored by the Welthungerhilfe advisor.

In addition, regular construction site monitoring missions are carried out by the Welthungerhilfe advisor. The Welthungerhilfe staffs supervise the construction in terms of accepted technical standards based on ICTAD (Institute for Construction, Training and Development) technical standards.

Interim- and final reports are submitted by SLF.

The monitoring system is appropriate and the impact monitoring was not evaluated.

1.2 Situation analysis and target group

For sixteen years (1986 – 2002), the Government of Sri Lanka (GoSL) and the Liberation of Tigers of Tamil Elam (LTTE) were engaged in an internal conflict in the north-eastern part of the country, splitting the island into two. Due to the political situation many families were displaced and houses and public installations were damaged. In 2002 a cease-fire agreement was signed between the two parties. Since then the island has been in an unstable situation, which started to further deteriorate in the middle of 2006 through increased fighting and hostilities, leading to a dramatically higher number of IDP-s in the north-eastern part of the country.

The implementation risks have increased in the LTTE-controlled Vanni area. The political conditions have resulted in an unstable security situation. The internal border under control of the GoSL and the LTTE currently threatened the supply of materials.

Sri Lanka's coastline in the north, east, south and south-west was hit by the Tsunami. More than 30,000 people died in Sri Lanka. Approximately 100,000 houses were destroyed or damaged. Almost 30,000 fishing boats, 168 public schools, 4 universities, 18 vocational training centres, 92 clinics and further infrastructure (roads and railway lines) were destroyed.

Many settlements in the districts of Mullativu and Jaffna were already strongly affected during the civil war. More than 800.000 people had been displaced. Approximately half of the people had returned to their home places and started to rebuild their lives. All these efforts were swept off by the Tsunami.

The evaluated projects are supporting the communities being affected by the Tsunami in the districts of Mullativu, Killinochi and Jaffna. The project area covers 8 villages with the total number of app 1500 families and represents mainly ethnic Tamils.

The housing and school projects in Jaffna District, in Point Pedro Division, are located in the area controlled by the Government of Sri Lanka. According to the official statistics 18,000 people were directly affected by the Tsunami in this Division. 450 of 4,430 houses were completely destroyed by the Tsunami and 1,681 houses were partly damaged.

The other housing projects are located in Killinochi and Mullativu District in the Wannu region. This area is controlled by LTTE. According to official statistics in this district 24,000 families were affected by the Tsunami and 13,473 houses were completely or partially destroyed or damaged.

Before the Tsunami the main source of income in Jaffna, in Mullativu and in Killinochi was fishing. Apart from that livestock farming and agriculture was practiced.

A well-organized market system for the selling of fish was and is not in place. Some petty dealers were buying the fish directly from the boats at cheap prices and transported the fish to the markets in small wooden boxes.

The interviews with the beneficiaries show a new situation of sources of income among the target group. The fishermen are strongly affected by the severe restrictions for fishing put in place by the government. Fishing is only allowed within view of the beach and on particular days of the week only. The income from fishing has decreased compared to the time before the Tsunami. Meanwhile, the livelihood measures are taking hold and women are starting to add income.

Most interview respondents have slightly more income these days as compared to the time before the Tsunami.

Prior to the tsunami some of the target families were already members of Community Based Organizations (CBOs), such as Women Rural Development Societies, Farmer Organizations, Livestock Breeders Association and Fisheries Cooperative Societies. These societies are self-governed, self-managed and registered with the relevant government agency, which is the GA Office.

The GoSL and others are using these existing structures to cooperate with the communities. After the Tsunami, most of these CBOs remain helpless and ineffective.

The Tsunami Reconstruction Programme of Welthungerhilfe with the projects LKA 1051 / 1052 / 1055 / 1062 / 1064 covers the same target group, i.e., most people receive new houses, and they benefit from the livelihood programme as well as the local infrastructure measures.

The success is visible, and the beneficiaries have expressed this. Quote: “We stand on our own feet”. The people expressed their gratitude and were aware of the advantages of combining the construction of houses with livelihood rehabilitation.

The visited CBO s are well organised. The women societies exuded self-confidence, contrary to the fishermen societies. The fishermen suffer from the existing fishing restrictions put in place due to the ongoing conflict.

The projects are popular within the community, and people do value their houses and the prospects of their personal lives. Before the tsunami most beneficiaries had lower quality houses, as was expressed during the interviews with the target group. On a positive note, people were grateful and aware of the contribution to stabilising their lives through the opportunity to generate their own income. Accordingly, there is high satisfaction within the community.

1.3 Analysis and assessment of project preparation

The major problem faced by all organizations in Sri Lanka is the conflict.

In the Wannu region, the project teams were faced to operate with two administrative structures, the Government of Sri Lanka (GoSL) and the Liberation of Tigers of Tamil Elam (LTTE). Decision-making processes and responsibilities among the local authorities were not always clear. The project teams had to exercise patience and needed to closely follow the project work.

According to statements from people involved in the implementation, each step of the project was characterized by significant time constraints, working pressure and complicated bureaucratic procedures.

The families in Jaffna District have been selected in close cooperation with the Government Agent (GA), Village Head Man (GS), Divisional Secretary (DS) of Jaffna and the fisherman cooperative societies. The selection procedure, and the compilation of the beneficiary list, was done by local authorities and then handed over to the Sewalanka Foundation (SLF). The meetings with the beneficiaries were joined by staff members of SLF. It is SLF's policy not to get openly involved in the selection process. SLF only acts as an observer. The beneficiaries were free to contact SLF confidentially. Following the selection the design was introduced to the beneficiaries and community meetings were held to inform people about the implementation process. Model houses were constructed and introduced to the target group.

In Mullativu in the Wannu region selected areas were relocated by the government, as assigned by the Divisional Secretary (DS) and countersigned by Government Agent (GA) under the control of the LTTE. The relocated areas are surveyed and subdivided in plots. Each new house owner is registered. The individual land register is in the process of being established by the land department of the government

In 2005 a Participatory Rural Assessment (PRA) was carried out by Sewalanka (SLF) in the District of Jaffna, Division Point Pedro in the village Suppermadam.

The families participated in the planning of the housing schemes. In accordance with Urban Development Authority (UDA) rules and guidelines the documentation has been worked out for every individual construction site, including:

- a site plan
- a Building Application Form
- a Floor Plan and Front Evaluation, Foundation Details, Door and Windowplan

- Letter of Agreement between SLF and the land owner
- Bill of Quantity (BoQ)

The planning process was accompanied by

- The representatives of the GA office in the government-controlled regions
- The representatives of the GA office and the PDS in the regions controlled by the government and the LTTE
- Beneficiaries

Measures:

- Coordination / Planning together with the local authorities
- Coordination / Planning together with the beneficiaries
- Preparation of BoQ and estimations done by SLF / Welthungerhilfe
- Coordination together with the engineer of the monitoring unit of the GA office / or PDS
- Preparation of tender documents by SLF / Welthungerhilfe
- Purchase of materials and transportation to sites
- Mobilization
- Construction done by construction teams in building segments
- Invoice verification and payment by SLF / Welthungerhilfe
- Take-over
- Hand-over to the beneficiary
- Monitoring and Evaluation by SLF / Welthungerhilfe and local authorities

1.4 Analysis and assessment of planning /project planning matrix

The introduced project planning documents follows the approach of linking Relief, Reconstruction and Development.

The Agreement of Allocation (AoA) describes the overall objective, the project purpose and the results. Other documents, e.g. Project Planning Matrix (PPM), describe the appropriate indicators, activities and resources of verifiability.

During the implementation process, each project had internally approved budget revisions.

The costs were within the newly allocated budgets and the adjustment of the actual needs as well as the necessities due to immense price increases were taken into consideration.

As the result shows, the budget considerations were appropriate for the target achievement. All projects were implemented within the allocated cost frame.

The personnel structure for handling of the projects was well thought-through and comprehensible. Complex building measures with an extensive number of process participants, a material distribution system and politically challenging circumstances require large work-forces. For the realization of the building measures the number of qualified staff members is adequate.

A more thorough analysis of the human resources' allocation, in a big organisation with a multitude of tasks and different financial backers, would require a separate evaluation. The office equipment, the office space and the means of transportation are adequate with regard to target achievement.

Education and further training is an important qualification instrument and is usually offered in the region in accordance with budgets and needs.

Both organisations, SLF and Welthungerhilfe, offer training opportunities to their staff members.

1.5 Analysis and assessment of project implementation

The evaluator had no access to the project areas located in the Wannu region. The overall assessment is therefore limited to the villages Suppermadam and Kothady, Point Pedro in Jaffna.

The housing and school projects, as well the livelihood program covers the same target group. All benefit from

- housing construction,
- building of basic infrastructure,
- vocational training,
- support of Community Based Organisation (CBO) development,
- and income generating activities.

The main project activities continued successfully in spite of difficulties caused by the conflict, time delays and initial staff shortages.

During implementation, SLF / Welthungerhilfe had to follow the technical standards, policy, guidelines, and rules and regulations of the Government.

The main activities and strategies have been implemented and are ongoing according to the proposals and Agreement of Allocation (AoA).

The planning document includes a clear architectural design.

All participants are well-informed and aware of their tasks and duties.

The filing system is well organized.

All construction measures are completed except the phase II of LKA 1062. Unfortunately, the evaluator was not able to inspect buildings under construction. The quality of the frame construction and the construction process can not be evaluated. The evaluator did see some of the photo documentation about the houses in different stages of construction, which left a positive impression.

Considering the evaluation criteria and objectives and the tense political situation the implementation is a success. The integrated approach has considerably improved the beneficiaries' situation.

1.6 Impact with regard to development

Due to the conflict the situation in Sri Lanka is fraught with uncertainty, and the implementation of the projects can neither be planned accurately nor predictably. The whole process is characterized by quick actions and decisions because of the complicated circumstances.

So far the project implementation has been kept within the estimated cost frame and is therefore to be considered efficient.

The proposed construction measures, regarding all projects, have been realized within the allocated budget as far as possible. The deviations in terms of reduction of a few house units are within an acceptable frame.

In terms of development-oriented first aid the projects LKA 1052, LKA 1055, LKA 1062, LKA 1064 put the focus on physical reconstruction. Usually the prospect of sustainability cannot be related to the physical reconstruction of the houses. The issue of sustainability needs to be considered in the context of the development of the village community and the overall infrastructure. The projects are implemented within the

project area of Sewalanka / Welthungerhilfe and in parallel the project LKA 1051 was implemented with livelihood components.

In summary, the significance of the projects is based on the fact that the target group is to benefit from the housing project and the livelihood programme. This integrated approach has considerably improved the situation of the beneficiaries.

The construction work was a support measure for the workers in order to improve their skills, especially given that construction work had not taken place in these areas for decades.

More than 350 students will benefit from the construction of the Unit of the Secondary School in Point Pedro. The establishing of schools for the affected children and the provision of school materials will benefit the children and their psychosocial well-being. The Tamil community shows a high interest in school education. In the last two decades people were strongly affected by the conflict and the tsunami. With regard to the development of a society the construction of schools is an important contribution; even considering that it is government's duty to provide the public with the necessary infrastructure.

The housing projects are of special significance for the individual. Some of the beneficiaries have moved into their houses, following long periods in camps or in other temporary living situations. These people have a chance to regain ordinary lives in terms of a structured life. Without doubt, the housing project will contribute to the reduction of poverty.

1.7 Project management

The projects are managed by SLF staff. The controlling functions are well covered with enough qualified staff members.

In addition, regular monitoring missions to the construction sites are done by Welthungerhilfe staff.

The communication between all parties involved works well, be it the local authorities, beneficiaries or the cooperation between SLF and Welthungerhilfe

The programme manager of the Welthungerhilfe head office in Bonn also pays visits to the project.

All relevant tools and instruments are in use, such as:

- Meetings
- Reporting
- Site supervision
- Controlling and assessment of construction time and costs
- Controlling of payment processes

1.8 Recommendations

The evaluator has only seen the office location in Jaffna. There are two offices, the district office and the construction unit, located in close proximity to each other.

Over the past years the construction unit was developed in parallel to the project implementation. This unit leaves a professional impression in terms of

- size and structure
- staff members
- equipment

The successful implementation of the projects is an indicator for a functioning organisational unit.

As a recommendation to the organisation, this ought to be valued and developed further according to needs and tasks.

The project documentation refers extensively to the construction of the latrines. Due to the high ground water table the construction of a soak pit was no longer possible. The proposed technology could thus not be implemented, and did not meet the official guidelines.

These circumstances were not taken into account during the planning phase. The planning of building measures needs to consider soil conditions, the ground water table, seasonal conditions, availability of materials etc. at a very early stage. This influences the architectural design, structural design, technical solutions and needs to also be considered in regard cost estimation and project duration.

Overall, it is hereby recommended to clarify all framework conditions with special care. Depending on the nature of a project, a team of experts needs to be gathered to elaborate on the project proposal. Poor planning at the outset will impact the process of implementation. As is often the case, increases with regard to time and money are based on incomplete initial planning documents.

The evaluator had a chance to visit the villages Suppermadam and Kothady in Point Pedro. Apart from the newly built soak pits, a sanitation system is not yet in place. Also, the supply of potable water and electricity is not satisfactory.

The poor drinking water supply is a burden on the people. All these components are not part of the SLF / Welthungerhilfe projects but rather under the responsibility of the local authorities. It should be noted that as long as the organizations are present in the project area they are able to support these issues through their communication with the authorities.

The Welthungerhilfe staff members talked about their unclear “roles” as advisors, since the “role” of the expatriates’ changes over time depending on objectives and project elements as well as competencies.

It is recommended to initiate discussions among the staff members of Welthungerhilfe and between the relevant staff members of SLF and Welthungerhilfe, with the goal to avoid possible tensions that might arise among team members.