
Community Agriculture & Watershed Management Project (CAWMP)

Penjikent / Tajikistan

PROJECT NUMBER:

AS 1313 / TJK 1047-05

Project duration: 01/2006 – 02/2009



Welthungerhilfe

Friedrich-Ebert-Straße 1
D- 53113 Bonn, Germany
Tel.: (+49) (0) 228-2288-0
Fax: (+49) (0) 228-2207-10
<http://www.welthungerhilfe.de>

Project Donor



The World Bank



The Government of Tajikistan

Carried out for:
Welthungerhilfe

By:
Dirk G. Zerhusen
D-37085 Goettingen, Germany

October 6, 2008

I. SUMMARY

1 Brief description of the project and framework conditions

The Community Agriculture and Watershed Management Project (CAWMP) implemented by Project Management Unit (PMU) of the Government of Tajikistan in four watersheds (Surkob, Zeravshan, Vanj, and Toirsu) is financed by the World Bank (WB). The Welthungerhilfe is the facilitating organisation (FO) for the Zeravshan Watershed. The Zeravshan Valley consists of 24 Jamoats¹ and is divided into three Districts: Penjikent, Ayni, and Gorno Matcha. The project started officially on the 1st January 2006 for a period of 54 months. The facilitating Welthungerhilfe-activities will end in February 2009.

The CAWMP provides technical assistance and organizational support on target group (TG) level (Jamoat Resource Centers (JRCs)) and their beneficiaries (Common Interest Groups (CIGs)) in the Zeravshan valley in order to efficiently make use of the following inputs provided through the project:

		Budget under control of:
CI	Credibility investment	Welthungerhilfe
A1-component:	Farm productivity improvement	World Bank
A2-component:	Land resource management	World Bank
A3-component:	Rural infrastructure	World Bank

The Overall goal of the project is: The living situation (Livelihood) of the inhabitants of the Zeravshan valley has sustainably improved. The threat from natural events (erosion) is reduced. The Project Goal is: The self-help potential and income situation of the population in the villages of the Valley Zeravshan is sustainable.

2 Outcomes and impacts

In the frame of the Community Action Plan (CAP), the Credibility Investments (CI) were used in mobilizing activities to attract potential beneficiaries right at the start of the project². The CI could be implemented promptly, since these funds are allocated directly through the Welthungerhilfe (unlike the sub-project funds). The main activities of CI have been used for gardening, greenhouses, mills (flour, oil) and small irrigation systems.

Sub-projects of "A1-Farm Productivity Improvements" like livestock breed improvement, bee-keeping and gardening are the most popular project activities within the target region. Bee-keeping projects are very profitable and therefore very popular in the target region. The increasing supply of honey should be observed in terms of the economic saturation point of this business (Rec.4).

A2-Subproject Land Management: TG takes notice that terracing and planting of orchards as well as contour planting of trees around their plots have positive environmental and economical effects. New terraces are being constructed with trees planted along the canals to bring sloping land under control and to supply households with firewood.

Farmers would utilize this component much more extensively if more irrigation facilities were available. But grants for such kinds of sub-projects (irrigation) are only available within the "A3-Subproject Rural Infrastructure" component. However this component is not yet released by the WB. This will most probably not happen until May 2009 when 80% of A1 and A2 component

¹ but only 18 Jamoats are included for the CAWMP (Jamoat: lowest governance level in Tajikistan)

² 1.000 US\$ per village

are established.

CI, A1 and A2 sub-project will significantly reduce poverty. Especially the impact of CI and A1-component will be immediately high, due to increasing income shortly after project implementation. Orchard and vineyard sub-projects are not yet harvestable but they will most likely be highly profitable for the CIGs in the next years.

3 Sustainability

The project is demonstrating appropriate conservation and resource management technologies (i.e. drip irrigation, hydraulic pump) to promote sustainable land use in the project region which will have a significant impact on the environment. It will ensure the sustainability of appropriate farming, as well as ensure the efficient and reliable supply of water for irrigation for agriculture in the valley. Additional vegetable and alternative crops have a high potential to become an integral part of agricultural production and in the provision of nutrition for the people. However, land titles are hard to obtain but very important for the TG to ensure project sustainability and to eliminate potential conflicts on newly cultivated lands with productive assets. Capacity building for the JRCs to assist the target group in the procedure to obtain land titles is advisable (Rec.16+17).

Currently the JRCs are depending solely on project inputs of CAWMP and UNDP, since they have only very little own productive activities. The project successfully conducted intensive trainings in capacity building trainings for the JRCs³. With regard to the sustainability more efforts are required to support JRCs in developing their own vision and designing their own plans to make this institution self-supporting in future (Rec.22).

To provide the TG with livestock appears very advantageous for the beneficiaries for the time being. However, because of the destructive environmental impact the CAWP should reconsider this approach.

The environmental part of sub-project proposals are more or less perceived as a compulsory duty which must be fulfilled according the requirements. It appears that the environmental risks and threats are not well understood by all stakeholders of CAWMP. Therefore it is very crucial to integrate environmental requirements much more thoroughly into the project cycle, and proposals should be scrutinized much more intensively in this respect (Rec.14).

4 Relevance

The CAWMP remains consistent with the Tajikistan's *Poverty Reduction Strategy Program (PRSP⁴)* in emphasizing addressing natural disasters, water pollution, soil degradation, deforestation and biodiversity conservation.

The CAWMP takes into account the local socio-economic and agro-ecological conditions of the Zeravshan Valley. The lack of arable land (esp. irrigated land) and the inappropriate use of sloping upland surfaces are the most evident features of food insecurity and degradation of the fragile land and ecosystem in the valley.

The activities of the project follow the *Country Strategy Paper of Tajikistan* of the Welthungerhilfe. The methodical focus is concentrated in the field of capacity building of local community organizations and the mobilization of human resources to support the institution building in the field of national NGOs.

5 Effectiveness

The implementation of the project objectives was carried out in accordance to the Project Planning Matrix (PPM) which was extracted from the contract signed between the PMU and

³ in co-operation with UNDP-Ayni (9 JRCs)

⁴ The Government of the Republic of Tajikistan. (June 2002): Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper, Dushanbe

Welthungerhilfe. However, all Project Goals and many of the Project Outputs have not been specified in detail to verify these results with appropriate indicators. The project orientates the project effectiveness more on the available budget for the project, since strong indicators are not formulated in an appropriate Project Planning Matrix (PPM). An M&E system in this respect was not implemented (Rec.3).

An appropriate instrument used methodically to assess and verify the socio-economical and environmental impact of the project and its sustainability in the project region does not exist.

To assess the project success with a "before-after analysis" based on observational surveys to confirm the net improvement of rural infrastructure and livelihood due to the project intervention is quite debatable. It will be rather impossible to attribute the development solely to the project intervention of CAWMP, since intervention of other organizations--especially UNDP (with a larger project budget and nearly identical target group)--and other Welthungerhilfe projects will have very significant influences for this development. A more target group orientated methodically M&E system would be more appropriate to more definitely verify the impact of CAWMP intervention.

6 Efficiency

More than 75% of entire project budget will be directly available for the target group and 17% is used for the personnel costs only.

It would be more efficient if the Welthungerhilfe would be in charge of all disbursements to the beneficiary organizations to reduce any impact of upstream funding delays and to ensure efficient and transparent methods of disbursements.

Sub-projects like gardening, greenhouses, orchards, and vineyards promise to become high profit makers with a high efficiency due to the provision of means and perspectives for an improved production system.

7 Annual cross-cutting theme

The project has been active in enhance the capability and capacity of the target group. Most of the JRCs will remain after the project concludes. They can utilize and maintain infrastructures on their own responsibility and are able to take steps to ensure they maintain technical and financial operation (*Self-Help-Approach*).

Beneficiaries within their Community Initiative Group (CIG) are establishing their own interest groups. They are very much engaged in their activities and have contributed a considerable input from their own means.

8 Most important recommendations

Funds of already approved sub-projects should be released without delay to ensure the timely commencement of sub-projects by the target group especially for projects which are dependent on the cropping season.

Integrate environmental requirements and obligations much more into the sub-project cycle, and proposals should be scrutinized more intensively in this respect by all stakeholders (FO, JRCs, CIs, WDC, PCU, and PMU).

For the sub-project implementation of "CAWMP-component-A3" the JRCs need much more expertise and skills. Therefore JRCs requires more support by the project.

Intensify environmental campaigns to make the target group aware of ecological issues.

Reconsider the support of livestock expansion to prevent an accelerating devastation in the Zeravshan Valley.

The project (later the JRCs) should assist the target group in the procedure of the

application of land titles to ensure project sustainability and to eliminate potential conflicts on newly cultivated lands with productive assets (i.e. Orchard, Vineyards, and Irrigated Land).

The project should consider the future of the JRCs to make the centers more attractive to the TG and thus sustainable.

9 General conclusions

With regard to the participatory approach in involving the target group in planning and implementation of appropriate technical solutions, the project will be very effective.

The project will make a contribution towards poverty reduction and food security by using primarily resource-saving methods.

More awareness, especially in environmental issues, can increase the motivation of the target group to use their knowledge and their capabilities for an advanced development of their watersheds toward the project objectives.