

# Evaluation

## Final Report

---

### Drought Response in the Health Sector in Kenya

PROJECT NUMBER  
**KEN-1089-11**  
**GIZ: 2010.2035.3**

Project duration: 01.09.11-30.04.12

---

#### Project Holder



#### Welthungerhilfe

Friedrich-Ebert-Straße 1  
D- 53113 Bonn, Germany

#### Project Donor

**giz**



#### Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ)

Dag-Hammarskjöld-Weg 1-5  
D-65760 Eschborn, Germany

---

28. April 2012

Carried out for:  
**Welthungerhilfe**  
D-53113 Bonn, Germany  
<http://www.welthungerhilfe.de>

By:  
**Dirk Zerhusen**  
D-37085 Goettingen, Germany  
<http://www.zerhusen-consult.de>

## I. SUMMARY

### 1 Brief description of the project and framework conditions

The BMZ/GIZ-funded project "*Drought Response in the Health Sector in Kenya*", implemented by Welthungerhilfe, addressing the negative impact of the protracted drought in various areas in Northern and North Eastern Kenya.

The main aim of the intervention in the health sector is to address the immediate need for essential hygiene kits in Dadaab and the supply of water in Tana River, Marsabit and Ukambani (areas of Makueni, Kitui, and Mwingi).

The principal objective of this project is to strengthen and upscale on-going emergency interventions to save lives and enhance the health of families with the provision of water and of basic hygiene kits to mitigate the risks of water-borne diseases in the communities of Dadaab, Marsabit and Tana River County

The project targets a total of 76,000 households (Dadaab 60,000; Marsabit 6,000; Tana River 5,000; and Ukambani 5,000).

The project has a budget of 2,205,132 EUR<sup>1</sup> and will be implemented from September 1, 2011 until April 2012 (eight months).

### 2 Relevance

The frequency and intensity of drought coupled with increased frequency of other extreme weather events due to climate change, such as rising temperatures and the lack of rain, as well as the security situation in Somalia has led to a high migration of pastoralists from Somalia into the camps of Dadaab but also into other bordering areas to Kenya such as Tana River County. These people have an urgent need of assistance as well in the health sector – essential hygiene kits – and in the supply of water in Tana River and Ukambani

### 3 Effectiveness

Despite the late commencement<sup>2</sup> the effectiveness of the project is good, and in some aspects very good. Almost all targeted results will be achieved in time. To compare with the figures of the project proposal and the logframe, even more beneficiaries have benefited than planned.

Welthungerhilfe started the emergency response program in Dadaab, Tana River and Marsabit in August 2011 jointly with GIZ agricultural projects of KEN-1087+88 in Ukambani and Marsabit.

The project maintains a very good relationship with all relevant line ministries in the country, which had a considerable positive impact on project execution (e.g. trainings, monitoring, and consultancy) and on ownership of this program.

Marsabit with its multicultural environment is a new target area for Welthungerhilfe, and requires a sensitive approach by the project personal to implement the project in this region. Training needs assessment and trainings for the project staff for preparation to work in this

<sup>1</sup> GIZ/BMZ: 90%; Welthungerhilfe: 10%;

<sup>2</sup> contract was signed on 14 Oct. '11

fairly fraught area have not been conducted. The handling of this complex ethnic environment was sometimes overwhelmed by the unsafe and tense situation.

In Marsabit the personnel composition represents all tribes which eases communication and cooperation with the multi-ethnic beneficiaries in the region.

The establishment of the project structures (e.g. office, storage, accommodation) at the peak of the emergency situation was challenging for the project staff in Dadaab. The staff recruitment procedure in Dadaab is a very sensitive and time consuming issue and has to consider host community desires.

In December 2011 the project was up-scaled with additional funds provided by BMZ (282,000 EUR). The main bulk of these funds was used for additional NFI kits for Dadaab.

A Coordination Unit in the Welthungerhilfe Regional Office Nairobi (RO) was implemented for the project since the project has five field offices for project implementation. Particularly during the initial phase of the project the Coordination Unit was not well integrated in the organisational structure which caused operational friction in the project execution.

The distribution of NFI is generally successful but sometimes hindered due to the security situation in the camps and to the fact that NFI have a minor priority in the schedule of the distribution cycle, as they use the food distribution points.

#### **4 Efficiency**

The project is aiming to assist 76,000 households, which will mean more than 320,000 direct beneficiaries.

The cost/benefit ratio of the overall project is evaluated on the basis of the percentage relationships, total running costs, equipment, personnel, etc. The initially planned entire project budget was 2,205,132 EUR.

More than 60% of the total budget was spent directly for the beneficiaries and here allocated mainly for Emergency Water Tankering (EWT) (33%), soaps (21%) and jerrycans (20%).

The personnel costs are quite low (17.5%) compared to the total budget allotments of the project. The cost/beneficiary ratio of 6.9 EUR is very acceptable.

For the rehabilitated infrastructure works (water pans), there are no average unit costs available since each of these structures has its own specific costs, making it impossible to compare these project activities with such general unit costs. The efficiency here is also enhanced by the remarkable voluntary contributions in kind (mainly work) from the population.

Approximate cost estimation for sanitation (EcoSan, pit latrines) and water harvesting facilities (Roof Catchments) are acceptable and are comparable the average costs of similar facilities in the region.

The Emergency Water Tankering (EWT) in Ukambani was conducted between 3 Oct.' 11 and 17 March '12. In this period about 762 water transports with a total mileage of about 33,500 kilometres were organised. The average distance between the water source and community distribution points is about 45 kilometres (maximum 91 km). About 11,000 m<sup>3</sup> of water have been delivered, providing about 111,500 beneficiaries with a total of almost 100 litres per person within this period. A calculation of the water delivery revealed an average project cost of 1.3 KES per litres.

The project execution was hindered due to extended monitoring requirements by the donor organization (GIZ) in the course of the project which was a huge additional workload in the areas of personnel management and their execution of the program activities. Staff from the agriculture project (KEN-1087) had to be recruited to assist in the collection of the required data.

## **5 Outcomes and impacts**

### Water Structures

Water structures (earth dams/pans, rain water roof catchments) were in good condition; some are still under construction. Most of the water facilities were dry due to the current absence of rain in the region.

At present, all embankment dams are exposed to erosion; this will have a significant impact on the longevity of the ponds. Protection mechanisms on the shoulder and the inlet area are required, as well as planting of grass or fodder species around the pond. However, most of the beneficiaries are aware of this issue and some of them have started already with grass planting on the slopes of the embankments, with varying degrees of success (due to drought).

Training in proper operation and maintenance of the improved earth dams to ensure the provision of water throughout the drought period is a key issue of the project. But training on asset management and maintenance does not seem to be sufficient to have the systems run sustainably by water user committees. Further trainings, as well as follow-up visits by e.g. the Extensionists of the respective line ministries, are required.

### Emergency Water Tankering (EWT)

In the Ukambani, Tana River and Marsabit region water trucking was conducted and there were some limiting factors which caused delays in the execution and a reduction of the amount of the striving delivery: long distances to the available water collection points (up to 90 km); suspended water trucking's due to the temporarily tense security situation, strikes by transporters over the prices of water trucking, long queues of trucks at the water points, bad road conditions and the related break downs of water trucks, vandalism of water pipes at water resource points.

The water distribution was discontinued after the rain commenced in mid-October in most of the project regions. Saved funds allocated initially for the EWT have been used for alternative activities, e.g. EcoSan toilets and to improve rainwater harvesting and storage structures at communal facilities (e.g. guttering systems in schools and dispensaries).

Beneficiary communities stated that the cases of water-borne diseases have decreased. The school attendance increased and teachers stated that pupils are healthier and are more attentive in the classrooms.

### Non-Food-Items (NFI)

The distribution of NFI (Hygiene Kids) was conducted in Dadaab and to a lesser extent in the Marsabit region. The distribution in Dadaab has to be coordinated in strong collaboration with WFP and CARE since Welthungerhilfe is using their *food distribution points* for the NFI distributions. This is rather time consuming since Welthungerhilfe has access only on two to three days in a month, since lifesaving activities like food distribution, and water & health provision have the highest priority for individuals.

In accordance to the project management, the funding of the project was in time and sufficient to provide all new arrivals with the required NFIs to date.

## EcoSan

It was felt that EcoSan toilets are not appropriate for an emergency project as they require a longer period of implementation that include trainings before the community can fully adapt the new system. Furthermore, people must first be sensitized, and social and religious barriers as well as conservative decision makers must be overcome for introduction.

## **6 Sustainability**

The integration of poverty reduction measures (e.g. capacity building trainings, rehabilitation of water structures, improvement of the water availability) into the emergency program has encouraged the project recipients to participate actively in the project planning and execution and has engaged many people in the self-development efforts.

The program has convinced and motivated the beneficiaries to participate actively in the programme execution and has engaged people in self-development efforts, which creates ownership.

In respect of the water trucking activities in the country, there is a continuing concern over the sustainability and cost-effectiveness of these interventions. Water trucking can be a short-term solution only, considering that it provides a very sensitive supply system which depends on financial, technical, and personal resources. It is expensive and not sustainable. The emergency water trucking is the price to pay for neglecting long term development in the regions.

The distribution of the NFI and water tankering provided assistance to the refugees and vulnerable people within the period of eight months. This does not have a sustainable impact bearing in mind that the refugees are expected to remain in the camps until food security and safety conditions in Somalia improve.

Rainwater harvesting in the country has an enormous potential to add additional drinking water to the community. To integrate these activities into project programmes, important technical requirements should be considered to make systems sustainable.

The EcoSan toilets promote sustainable sanitation in the schools of the project regions through capacity development and knowledge management as a contribution to health, poverty alleviation, improved environmental quality and the agricultural production.

However, this requires projects with a longer time horizon because capacity building and lobbying is needed so that the authorities understand that investing in ecological sanitation systems benefits several public interests, such as protecting health and the environment and improving agricultural production.

## **7 Most important recommendations**

- 1 The efficiency of the KEN-1089-program coordination unit should be reviewed by the Welthungerhilfe Regional Office Nairobi (RO) with regard to its efficiency, mandatory power and the decision-making authority.
- 2 Train and sensitize the project staff, in the framework of their assignment, in the interaction and conflict management to work in the societies of different ethnic groups.
- 3 Create an M&E-Officer position at the Regional and Field-Office levels.
- 4 Organize regular, specific project meetings as needed for knowledge transfer and to discuss upcoming issues.

- 5 Intensify trainings for water user committees in maintenance and protection of the water dams against erosion and silting.
- 6 Have trainings evaluated by the participants for further learning and to improve the quality of project inputs.

## **8 General conclusions and "Lessons Learnt"**

- 1 The links between the community and the relevant line ministries and institutions are prerequisite for an effective and sustainable development in the target region.
- 2 The active involvement of local stakeholders (government line ministries, dioceses, community elders, chiefs, religious leaders) facilitates access to the project area and eases familiarization with the target beneficiaries.
- 3 Short-term projects cannot ensure sustainable capacity building of important organisational structures (e.g. water structures) within target groups.
- 4 The integration of poverty reduction measures (capacity building, improvement of water availability) into the emergency program has convinced and motivated the beneficiaries to participate actively in the programme execution and has engaged people in self-development efforts, which in turn raises ownership.
- 5 A deep understanding of the social cultural dynamics is important for integrating consideration and awareness into the planning and design of projects, to avoid conflicts, and to ensure effective implementation among communities.
- 6 Programmes should be aware of adverse external factors (such as climatic conditions) and take into account unfavourable periods for starting and financing activities, especially in construction sectors (e.g. construction work of earth dams) which comprise components that depend entirely on the climatic season.
- 7 To maximize the implementation effectiveness and efficiency of project and programs, the GIZ should deliberate the harmonization and alignment of rules and procedures of monitoring and reporting (comparison with current practice of KEN-1087/1088 and KEN-1089).